

What Ought A Program Committee To Do?

Mark Allman International Computer Science Institute

USENIX WOWCS April 2008

"And when the radical priest Come to get me released We was all on the cover of Newsweek



- Old World: Internet is our sandbox
- New World: Internet is *crucial infrastructure*

• This has many practical implications, which includes questions about the appropriateness of our experiments and measurements

Overview (cont.)

- Issues of appropriateness have started being asked within program committees
 - E.g., when does measurement traffic become an attack? (See [11])
 - E.g., how should public measurement data be treated? (See [3,10,5])
 - E.g., how should our research platforms like PlanetLab be treated? (See [7])
 - E.g., how should users be treated and do we need their consent? (See [12])

Decisions, Decisions

- Job of a PC is to accept or reject papers
- How much should ethical considerations play into that process?

Decisions (cont.)

- Easy approach: just judge the technical contribution
 - aligns well with our expertise
 - community can police itself
 - e.g., [3, 10,5] trifecta

Decisions (cont.)

- The flip side:
 - PCs are in a unique position to take concrete action
 - Doing nothing could spiral into a culture that rewards only the ends without even considering the means
 - Shady experimental techniques might hurt a venue's reputation (or, sponsors)
 - Could be viewed as protecting community resources (e.g., shared facilities and data)

Further Questions

 If a PC does make a judgement that some methodology is inappropriate and rejects a papers, is that it?

- Should there be some further "investigation" or "sanction"?
 - similar to suspected plagarism ?
 - perhaps databases of previous reviews would be enough?
 - perhaps the next PC will figure things out?

The IRB

- What is the role of the Institutional Review Board?
 - seems like a potentially useful avenue for vetting

- If it is OK with an IRB should it be OK for our conferences?
- What about thorny methodologies that do not involve human subjects?



So ... What Ought A Program Committee To Do?

Mark Allman

mallman@icir.org http://www.icir.org/mallman/

Extra Slides

Related Work

- Legal aspects of our work
 - E.g., [9, 13]
- Professional code of conduct
 - E.g., ACM code [6]
 - Can cut both ways
- Compromise of algorithms
 - E.g., [8]
 - We focus on running systems

Allman